

1 JEAN E. WILLIAMS,  
2 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
3 SETH M. BARSKY, Section Chief  
4 MEREDITH L. FLAX, Assistant Chief  
5 COBY HOWELL, Senior Trial Attorney  
6 MICHAEL R. EITEL, Senior Trial Attorney  
7 U.S. Department of Justice  
8 Environment & Natural Resources Division  
9 Wildlife & Marine Resources Section  
10 1000 S.W. Third Avenue  
11 Portland, OR 97204  
12 Phone: (503) 727-1023  
13 Fax: (503) 727-1117  
14 Email: [coby.howell@usdoj.gov](mailto:coby.howell@usdoj.gov)

*Attorneys for Federal Defendants*

12 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
13 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA (Oakland)

16 CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL  
17 DIVERSITY, ET AL.,

18 Plaintiffs,

19 vs.

20 DAVID BERNHARDT, ET AL.,

21 Federal Defendants.  
22

Case. No. 4:19-cv-05206-JST

**STIPULATED ADMINISTRATIVE  
MOTION TO EXCEED PAGE  
LIMITATIONS**

24 Pursuant to Local Civil Rules 7-11 and 7-12, the parties stipulate to allow  
25 Federal Defendants to file a reply brief in support of their motion to dismiss that  
26 exceeds the page limit provided in Local Civil Rule 7-3(c) by no more than ten (10)  
27 additional pages for the following reasons:  
28

1. This Court has related three cases that challenge the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (“FWS”) and National Marine Fisheries Service (“NMFS”) regulations implementing the Endangered Species Act (“ESA”): *Center for Biological Diversity v. Bernhardt*, 19-cv-5206 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 21, 2019); *California v. Bernhardt*, 19-cv-6013 (N.D. Cal., Sept. 25, 2019); *Animal Legal Def. Fund v. Bernhardt*, 19-cv-06812 (N.D. Cal., Oct. 21, 2019).

2. On January 7, 2020, Plaintiffs in the three related cases filed separate oppositions to Federal Defendants' motions to dismiss, and in some cases attached dozens of declarations. ECF 46 (*California* Motion); ECF 33 (*Center* Motion); ECF 21 (*Animal Legal Def. Fund* Motion); ECF 41-1, 48-24 (*Center's* Declarations); ECF 39-1, 39-5 (*Animal Legal Def. Fund's* Declarations).

3. Instead of filing three reply briefs, which could total 45 pages under Local Civil Rule 7-3(c), Federal Defendants seek to consolidate their arguments into one reply brief for all three cases.

4. In order to address all three oppositions in one consolidated reply brief, the parties stipulate to allowing Federal Defendants ten (10) additional pages than otherwise provided under the Local Rule for a total of no more than 25 pages.

DATED: January 22, 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

1 JEAN E. WILLIAMS,  
2 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
3 SETH M. BARSKY, Chief  
4 MEREDITH L. FLAX, Assistant Chief

5 /s/ Coby Howell.

6 COBY HOWELL, Senior Trial Attorney  
7 U.S. Department of Justice  
8 Environment & Natural Resources Division  
9 Wildlife & Marine Resources Section  
10 MICHAEL R. EITEL, Senior Trial Attorney  
11 U.S. Department of Justice  
12 Environment & Natural Resources Division  
13 Wildlife & Marine Resources Section  
14 1000 S.W. Third Avenue  
15 Portland, OR 97204  
16 Phone: (503) 727-1023  
17 Fax: (503) 727-1117  
18 Email: [coby.howell@usdoj.gov](mailto:coby.howell@usdoj.gov)

19 *Attorneys for Federal Defendants*

20 *By permission: /s/ Kristen Boyles*

21 KRISTEN L. BOYLES (CSBA # 158450)  
22 PAULO PALUGOD (NYBA # 5047964)  
23 [Admitted Pro Hac Vice]  
24 Earthjustice  
25 705 Second Avenue, Suite 203  
26 Seattle, WA 98104  
27 Ph: (206) 343-7340 | Fax: (206) 343-1526  
28 kboyles@earthjustice.org  
ppalugod@earthjustice.org

ANDREA A. TREECE (CSBA # 237639)  
Earthjustice  
50 California Street, Suite 500  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Ph: (415) 217-2089 | Fax: (415) 217-2040  
atreece@earthjustice.org

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

1 \* In compliance with Civil Local Rule 5-1(i), the filer of this document attests that  
2 all signatories listed have concurred in the filing of this document.  
3

4  
5 ~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER

6 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED,  
7

8  
9 Dated January 27, 2020 :

10  
11   
12

13 The Honorable Jon S. Tigar

14 U.S. District Court Judge  
15  
16  
17

18 **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

19 I hereby certify that I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the  
20 Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such to the  
21 attorneys of record.  
22  
23

24 /s/ Coby Howell

25 COBY HOWELL, Senior Attorney  
26  
27  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28